УДК 65.012.8:33:061.5 JEL Classification: M21; L15

CRITICAL ISSUES
OF ECONOMIC SECURITY OF ORGANIZATIONS

N. Moskalenko

According to international research, the 21st century has been recognized as a century of fraud, because this type of crime is not particularly serious and thus not strictly punishable, but it is very lucrative, hard to find and prove. The most typical threats to economic security and problems caused by them have been summarized based on the research into economic crimes in Ukraine and in the world. The results of the study of economic crimes in Ukraine and in the world conducted by the international auditing company PricewaterhouseCoopers, the author's in-depth study of the problems of organization and management of economic security, observations and surveys have been presented. According to the survey, the most typical and traditional types of economic crime are considered to be the misappropriation of assets, bribery and corruption, fraud in procurement and accounting; the level of economic fraud in the world in 2016 reached the level of economic crime in Ukraine according to the data of 2011 and it is a common threat to companies operating in the global market; indicators of economic crimes typical of Ukraine are the misappropriation of assets and corruption, increased internal frauds, crimes on the level of senior management of organizations, the lack of punishment for economic crimes. The subdivisions performing the functions of economic security in organizations have been described. According to the research results, recommendations have been given for the construction of systems of economic security in organizations, the rules which should be followed and the main elements of this kind of system have been identified and described.

Keywords: economic security, economic crime, fraud, organization, provisions of economic security.

АКТУАЛЬНІ ПИТАННЯ ЕКОНОМІЧНОЇ БЕЗПЕКИ ОРГАНІЗАЦІЙ

Москаленко Н. О.

Згідно зі світовими дослідженнями, XXI століття визнано століттям шахрайства у сфері економічної безпеки, оскільки цей вид злочину не arepsilon особливо тяжким, тому за нього суворо не карають, але він є дуже прибутковим і його важко виявити та довести. Узагальнено найбільш типові загрози економічній безпеці та проблеми, до яких вони призводять, на підставі досліджень економічних злочинів в Україні та світі. Подано результати досліджень економічних злочинів в Україні та світі міжнародної аудиторської компанії PricewaterhouseCoopers, глибокого вивчення автором проблеми організації й управління економічною безпекою, спостережень і опитувань. Як показав огляд, найбільш типовими та традиційними видами економічних злочинів уважають привласнення активів, хабарництво й корупцію, шахрайство у сфері закупівель та бухгалтерського обліку; рівень економічного шахрайства у світі за даними 2016 року досяг значень економічної злочинності в Україні за даними 2011 року і є спільною загрозою для компаній, що працюють на світовому ринку; показники економічних злочинів, характерні для України, — це незаконне привласнення активів і корупція, зростання кількості внутрішніх шахрайських операцій, злочини на рівні вищого керівництва організацій, відсутність системи покарання за економічні злочини. Наведено підрозділи, які виконують функції забезпечення економічної безпеки в організаціях. За результатами досліджень розроблено рекомендації щодо побудови систем економічної безпеки в організаціях, виділено й описано

Ключові слова: економічна безпека, економічні злочини, шахрайство, організація, положення економічної безпеки.

положення, яких варто дотримуватися, основні елементи такої системи.

АКТУАЛЬНЫЕ ВОПРОСЫ ЭКОНОМИЧЕСКОЙ БЕЗОПАСНОСТИ ОРГАНИЗАЦИЙ

Москаленко Н. А.

Согласно мировым исследованиям, XXI век признан веком мошенничества в сфере экономической безопасности, так как этот вид преступления не является особо тяжким, поэтому строго не наказывается, но является очень прибыльным и трудно обнаруживаемым и доказуемым. Обобщены наиболее типичные угрозы экономической безопасности и проблемы, к которым они приводят, на основании исследований экономических преступлений в Украине и мире. Представлены результаты исследований экономических преступлений в Украине и мире международной аудиторской компании *PricewaterhouseCoopers*, глубокого изучения автором проблем организации и управления экономической безопасностью, наблюдений и опросов. Как показал обзор, наиболее типичными и традиционными видами экономических преступлений считаются присвоение активов, взяточничество и коррупция, мошенничество в сфере закупок и бухгалтерского учета; уровень экономического мошенничества в мире по данным на 2016 год достиг значений экономической преступности в Украине по данным 2011 года, и является общей угрозой для компаний, работающих на мировом рынке;

показатели экономических преступлений, характерные для Украины, — это незаконное присвоение активов и коррупция, рост количества внутренних мошеннических операций, преступления на уровне высшего руководством организаций, отсутствие системы наказания за экономические преступления. Приведены подразделения, выполняющие функции обеспечения экономической безопасности в организациях. По результатам исследований даны рекомендации по построению систем экономической безопасности в организациях, выделены и описаны положения, которых стоит придерживаться, основные элементы такой системы.

Ключевые слова: экономическая безопасность, экономические преступления, мошенничество, организация, положения экономической безопасности.

Security management, in particular, corporate, economic security, is a topic which, on the one hand, attracts attention and arouses the interest of specialists, professionals in this field and related ones and students who want to take their place in interesting and economically attractive areas. On the other hand, it is a mixed assessment of auditors and leaders of provision of adequate services in the organizations and the content of their work. Despite the fact that in the practice of companies covering the international market with a large base of products and customers service departments of corporate and economic security have been operating since the end of the Cold war, today they are independent units within the organization's structure, including a large staff of security managers, specialists and analysts on economic security, business intelligence, compliance, internal auditors, etc.

Departments and services of economic or corporate security, adherence to corporate standards in the sphere

of security are an objective requirement for companies aimed at a long-term development and working in a constantly changing business environment, full of fears, threats and global challenges.

The complexity of this type of activity is explained by the need to look ahead to the trends in social, technological, business, global competition, criminal justice system, crime and other associated changes, the reliance on the growing and rapidly changing information-driven environment.

Among the most significant factors at the global level that contribute to the development of security systems worldwide, training and development of a wide range of economic security the following ones are worth mentioning:

- 1. The changing world order, in which competition in the global market is determined by the desire for competitive advantages over competitors worldwide;
- 2. High level of activity of hackers, terrorism, spies in the world.
- 3. The development of espionage, its expansion and change from the theft of national secrets to greater attention to the theft of corporate information and the use of the Internet to conduct network espionage with the help of techno-spies or network agents.

- 4. E-Commerce or e-business as a growing and progressive part of corporate business.
- 5. The pressure of a military superpower or regional alliances like the NATO, the European Union, geographical spread of Islamist fundamentalism; conflicts with the former Soviet Union countries.
- 6. Increased difficulties associated with old and new threats using new and old techniques.
- 7. The transition from manual labor to the power of brain in modern states.

But the greatest danger for modern organizations is economic crime, as an integral indicator of the influence of all these factors.

According to international research, the 21st century has been recognized as the century of fraud, because this type of crime is not particularly serious (not a murder or a robbery), and thus not strictly punishable, but it is very lucrative and hard to find and prove [1].

According to the estimates of the international auditing company PricewaterhouseCoopers (PWC) [2], 36 % of organizations (more than one third) are victims of economic crimes; cybercrimes take the 2nd place among all the registered economic crimes (32 %); about half of the surveyed organizations believe that the local law enforcement lack resources to investigate economic crimes, leave the responsibility for combating economic crime to organizations.

An overview of the dynamics of economic crime

in Ukraine was firstly conducted and presented in 2009 [3], then in 2011 [4]. The survey confirms the negative impact of the economic crisis on the level of economic crime. Successive political and economic crises in Ukraine impede further research and getting actual data on economic crime and its factors in the country. However, the results of the Ukrainian survey coincide with the conclusions of the world report and confirm the rising risk of economic crime. Therefore, the detection of illegal actions and prevention of economic fraud is critically important to Ukrainian business in the economic crisis.

In this regard, with the growing threat of economic crime, the functional load on the departments and services dealing with economic security and corporate security service is increasing.

The basic idea and purpose of this article is to summarize the most typical threats to economic security in the world and in Ukraine, to delineate the range of functional objectives and requirements for the construction of the economic security system in the organization, to identify the key levels and responsible entities.

The most typical and traditional types of economic crime are considered to be the misappropriation of assets, bribery and corruption, fraud in procurement and accounting. Fig. 1 presents the estimates of typical types of fraud according to PWC.

Fig. 1. Types of economic crime experienced, % of respondents who experienced economic crime [2]

Misappropriation of assets is historically considered to be the easiest fraud to detect as it is very easy to identify and predict. The main methods used are the tightening of organizational controls and analytical procedures of internal audit.

The greatest threat today is cybercrime that takes the 2nd place for several reasons: increasing prevalence of this type of fraud, difficulty in identifying threats, and lack of preventive measures.

Fig. 2 shows how the profile of economic crime has changed in the world from 2011 to 2016. It should be noted that the general declining trend is observed in the cases of asset misappropriation and accounting fraud, the rate of decline of these indicators is approximately equal, which indicates their common nature of threats and causes. Corruption and bribery exhibit unstable dynamics. Cybercrime is growing rapidly. Moreover experts explain the growth of this type of fraud on the background of the reduction of cases of fraud with assets and in accounting by new technologies and transformation of these threats. For example, there are financial crimes committed by organized groups of individuals who are well funded and engaged in theft of funds and other assets with the help of modern technologies.

A parallel drawn between the estimates of economic crimes in the world and Ukraine, based on the results of the recent studies makes it possible to present the following results (Table 1).

Table 1

Comparison of general indicators of economic crimes in Ukraine and in the world (based on [2; 4])

Economic crime in the world (according to 2016)	Economic crime in Ukraine (according to 2011, last survey)	
The share of organizations		
that fell victims to economic crimes		
36 %	36%	
The share of organizations which do not assess risk		
1/5	1/3	
The most common types of economic crime:		

asset misappropriation	
64 %	73 %
bribery & corruption	
24 %	60 %
The extent of economic cybercrime (in rank order)	
second	fifth

It can be noted that the overall level of economic fraud in the world has reached the estimates of economic crime

in Ukraine according to the data of 2011, which is a common threat to companies operating in the global market. The indicators where Ukraine still occupies the leading position are misappropriation of assets and corruption, these alone, according to the data in 2011, exceeding the global indicators of 2016 more than twice. Ukraine continues to be characterized by the increase of the number of internal frauds, crimes on the level of senior management of organizations, the lack of punishment for economic crimes.

The greatest number of economic crimes today, both worldwide and in Ukraine are those perpetrated in the financial and public sectors, transportation and logistics, retail and consumer products, communications, aerospace and defense, insurance, energy, utilities and the mining industry.

Thus, the level of economic crime is very high and

becomes the most dangerous economic threat to organizations in mature and emerging markets. The methods of economic security of organizations are inadequate, and in some cases they do not work. Therefore it is necessary to look for new opportunities and take them into account when building the system of corporate security. Such methods need to be proactive and able to confront economic crimes.

Functions that ensure economic security, for example, in big companies are distributed between the following departments:

internal audit and internal control, risk management, security, control and revision, compliance, information security services, corporate interaction,

services, controlling execution of the instructions of the supreme body of governance, the Business Ethics Commission, etc.

The maximum number of structural subdivisions and specialists of the organization (planning and economic service, accounting, personnel management, etc.) may be involved in providing economic security. Adherence to the available principles and provisions of economic security are very important. These are:

- 1. The existence of the concept of economic security of an organization as a document approved by the highest organizational level authority and shared by the staff at all levels of the organization. In practice, not all even big companies and businesses share the need for this kind of document, often replacing it with another equally important Regulations and Codes. However, this kind of document should provide a clear definition of threats to the activities of the organization taking into account product specification, the industry sector, particularities of business environment and macro environment.
- 2. The agreement of this conception with the provisions and instructions of the functional units responsible for economic security, the consolidation of provisions in the functional objectives of these units.
- 3. The existence of organized patterns of economic security, a clear separation of functions. In practice, different approaches are applied to the construction of corporate security services, as an independent body, separating powers parallelly with internal control and audit service risk management, compliance, etc., or as a structure that combines the listed departments in a single chain. This is determined by a number of features, such as: the legal form and the size of the organization, interest of owners, strategic plans, organization's experience in international markets, vulnerability to environmental factors.
- 4. Organizational subordination and responsibility of economic security services, level of privacy and independence. Also in practice there are different approaches: subordination to the General Director or to the Board of Directors. Incorrect selection of the approach to the construction of the economic security system can lead to organizational errors that create additional challenges and threats, such as abuse of power by individual officials, offences, leak of confidential information, pressure from management, loss of control, weak control, etc.
- 5. The introduction of standards for financial and economic security and adherence to them. This issue has been fairly discussed in [6], and presented in Table 2.
- 6. The tactical and strategic plans available to ensure financial and economic security and the choice of appropriate methods. In practice Ukrainian organizations, as a rule, don't pay enough attention to planning security units' work, focusing on operational and tactical measures of protection. However, considering the financial and economic security as a function which enables and supports the efficient flow of business processes of an organization, as well as the financial burden on the costs of the organization that are associated with the functions of economic security, these services need to be proactive and comply with the strategic development objectives and efficiency, and therefore be a part of organization's strategy.

Standards that can be used to provide organization's economic security

Type of standard	Names and developers	Content
Business Continuity Management (BCM)	BCI (Business Continuity Institute); DRI (Disaster Recovery Institute) and SANS (SysAdmin, Audit, Network, Security Institute); Standards and Certificates of the British Standard Institute (BSI); Directions of the Australian National Audit Organization (ANAO)	Analysis of business processes; risks analysis; non-stop business strategy development; organizational and technical support
Quality management standards	Standard ISO-9000 (International Organization for Standardization)	Managers' responsibility; resource management; sales; measurement, analysis and improvement
Project management standards	Standard ISO-21500 (International Organization for Standardization); PMBoK (Project Management Body of Knowledge) — the International Nonprofit Project Management Institute	Application of methods, tools, techniques and competencies to the project; project management groups
Industry management standards (production management)	Standards MRP/ERP (Material Requirements Planning/Enterprise Resources Planning); APICS (American Production and Inventory Control Society)	Material requirements planning; production resources planning; enterprise's resources planning
Risk-management standards	Standard ISO 31000 (International Organization for Standardization)	The growth of brand and image value; company's costs management, its efficiency improvement, etc.

Standards of supplier evaluation	Initiative AIM PROGRESS	Checking suppliers; setting communications system for effective cooperation with them
Supply chain security	Standard ISO 28000 (International Organization for Standardization)	Financing, manufacturing, information management, packaging, storage and control of goods movement by different types of vehicles
Stakeholder management standards	GRI (Global Reporting Initiative)	Narrative reporting on the voluntary use of reports on economic and environmental areas of enterprise's activities, products and services
	Standard AA 1000 SES (Stakeholder Engagement Standard) – the Institute of Social and Ethical Reporting	Recommended regulatory framework for the public use when planning, implementing, evaluating, informing and non-financial checking of stakeholder interaction quality
	Standard ISO-26000 "Guide on Social Responsibility" (International Organization for Standardization)	Guidelines on the principles, main topics and problems that underlie social responsibility, ways of integrating socially responsible behavior in strategies, practices and processes of a company

The awareness of both the authorities and the staff about the internal environment of the organization, plays an important role in ensuring economic security. One out of five respondents did not know about the existence of formal ethics and complains programs; most are mistaken about who owns it, who is accountable. Almost half of serious incidents of economic crime are committed within the organization. The main causes are the morale of the employees (44 %) and reputational damage (32 %) [2]. So today there is an objective

necessity for organizations to perform security controls

embedded in the organizational culture and described in the Code of Ethics "People and Culture: Your First Line of Defense" – as determined by PWC.

Primarily, this is due to the nature of all economic crimes, all crimes and fraud are committed by people and explained by their values, interests, and motives. The authors of the book on corporate security noted that if someone is not motivated to commit a violation of rules or law in relation to corporate assets, then they won't do it, even if there are all the opportunities and conditions for this [7].

Any organization consists of people and it is their culture, shared values, and morale that create a strong organization and form the protection system. In terms of impact on economic crimes, according to PWC, the highest degree is the morale of the staff, then reputation (power brand), business relations, relations with the regulator, the prices [2]. In all cases, the organization is perceived as a business both inside and outside. This highlights the key role of values in successful business strategy.

The gap between internal and external fraud has erased. One out of five respondents does not assess the risk of fraud.

In Ukraine, in contrast to the findings of the global survey, the majority of managers believe that external fraud is the main threat to the organization while the world practice considers internal threats as the main source of risks.

The main sources of external fraud are:

customers,

agents and brokers,

suppliers.

There is some dissonance of threat causes and security factors. So, on the one hand the development of the Internet, information technology and software allows the use of existing databases for financial monitoring and performing business intelligence without the distraction of additional resources and in a short period of time. However, the development of e-commerce and the emergence of new forms of business organization (using the Internet), lead to new threats and challenges in the assessment of the supplier – a foreign company, its reputation, business history, financial status, etc.

From the point of view of internal risks, the main source of threats to Ukrainian organizations is the actions of members of middle-level management. Internal risks are divided according to the level of organization management (Fig. 3).

Shareholders are the most motivated peoples in ensuring economic security. The main threats to the owners of the organization can be:

the transfer of ownership to third parties, a hostile takeover;

disadvantage for the owner selling;

the transfer of ownership to the top management of the organization;

the loss of control over the business, control transferred to third parties;

liquidation of the organization;

the functioning of the organization against the interests of the owners.

Fig. 3. The levels of economic activities of the organization corresponding to the levels of economic security

The most common ways of transfer of ownership to the organization management are as follows:

significant material benefits through the organization and as a result a ransom from the owners of the organization;

negative assessment of the economic and financial condition of the organization in the eyes of the owner, as a result, the reduction of the owner's interest to the ownership of the organization, and accordingly, the reduction of the organization price in sale;

the use of third-party entities to control accounts payable or using the mechanism of bankruptcy.

In some cases, the group of managers do not risk to change the folded-up position, and the company exists in the ownership of one person, but actually being controlled and bringing a portion of income to other people. Third parties may be usually interested in the business of the organization, in the following cases:

organization partners (suppliers or buyers) who wish vertical integration;

contractors of competitors who also want vertical integration, but find the organization to be more suitable for takeover for some reasons, rather than rival;

rivals of the organization, willing to take a stronger position in the market by expanding the niches;

professional speculators' organizations;

other third-party organizations.

More than half of all economic crimes in Ukraine have been identified through the risk management procedures, formal channels of information about fraud or internal security service, compared with the global overview, where this figure is twice as low. And a quarter of cases of fraud in Ukraine were discovered by accident.

The proportion of fraud detection in Ukraine with the help of internal audit is not significant, confirming the early stage of the development of this function in Ukraine, low analytical support and underdeveloped financial systems and economic security of organizations. Meanwhile worldwide internal audit is considered a guarantee of economic security. More than three quarters (76 %) of respondents said that they rely on their internal audit subdivision for assessment of the effectiveness of their compliance programs.

Cyber threats are growing, the majority of reported economic crime affect 32 % of organizations in the world [2]. Organizations show their unwillingness to confront cybercrime. Most companies realize that they risk to face cyber threats, but only 37 % of organizations have a plan of cyber response to such incidents. However, only half of the Board of Directors are involved in the organization's cyber-readiness and ask for this information. Therefore, experts argue that a cyber-response plan to the threat is required.

A significant role in economic crimes is played by the financial system and work of regulatory bodies. Thus, international experts speak about an ongoing fight against money laundering [2]. According to the estimates, one out of five banks experienced the enforcement action from the regulator. Hence, the

disability to fight against illegal business practices that may result in personal liability. More than a quarter of financial companies do not assess risk across their global system, experiencing major technical problems. The lack of experienced employees is a serious problem. Therefore, it is important how the organization controls the internal processes and interacts with external entities and regulatory agencies. The value of compliance and lack of compliance continue to grow.

To sum up, the threats to economic security of organizations expand and become more complex. The number

of departments in the organization performing functions of prevention and detection of economic crimes increase. However, according to the international auditing company, the traditional methods and control procedures are ineffective in fraud detection, therefore, special measures and procedures are required. In different organizations these functions are performed by internal auditors, security services and several other units. Obviously, the organization and management of economic security should study the effectiveness of these services, and if is necessary, they should be reorganized with clear specification and coordination of their functions. Therefore, further researches on economic security issues and solutions should be aimed at: the improvement of the economic security system of the organization and cooperation of its elements, the development of analytical tools for economic crime prevention in organizations, control procedures, formation of strategic and tactical plans to ensure economic security, especially a cyber plan.

References: 1. Федулов М. Концепция безопасности бизнеса: правильная постановка вопросов [Електронний ресурс] / М. Федулов

// Association of Certified Fraud Examiners, 2011. — Режим доступа: http://www.acferus.org/page.php?id=155. 2. Global Economic Crime Survey 2016 [Electronic resource] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2016. —

56 р. – Access mode: http://www.pwc.com/gx/en/economic-crime-survey/pdf/GlobalEconomicCrimeSurvey2016.pdf. 3. Bcecвітній огляд динаміки економічної злочинності. Звіт по Україні [Електронний ресурс] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2009. – 6 с. – Режим доступу: https://www.pwc.com/ua/en/services/forensic/assets/gecs_2009_report_ukraine_ukr.pdf. 4. Україна. Всесвітній огляд економічних злочинів. Кіберзлочини в центрі уваги [Електронний ресурс] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2011. – 16 с. – Режим доступу: https://www.pwc.com/ua/uk/press-room/assets/gecs_ukraine_ua.pdf. 5. Cybercrime: protecting against the growing threat [Electronic resource] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2011. – 40 р. – Access mode: http://pwc.blogs.com/files /2011-global-economic-crime-survey-report.pdf. 6. Moskalenko N. Approaches to enterprises' financial and economic security management

/ N. Moskalenko, O. Romanenko, T. Oliinyk // Economic Annals-XXI. — 2015. — No. 7—8 (1). — P. 54—57. 7. Kovacich G. L. The Manager's Handbook for Corporate Security: Establishing and Managing a Successful Assets Protection Program / G. L. Kovacich, E. P. Halibozek. — Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, 2003. — 463 р. 8. Нескородева І. І. Дослідження сутності економічної категорії "неплатоспроможність підприємства" / І. І. Нескородева, С. А. Пустовгар // Економіка розвитку. — 2013. — № 3 (67). — С. 68—72. 9. Williams A. R. Corporate Manager's Security Handbook / A. R. Williams. — Bloomington: AuthorHouse, 2012. — 84 р. 10. Hayes B. Corporate Security Organizational Structure,

/ D. Hayes, G. Kane, K. Kotwica. – Amsterdam : Elsevier, 2013. – 76 p.

References: 1. Fedulov M. Kontseptsiya bezopasnosti biznesa: pravilnaya postanovka voprosov [Electronic resource] / M. Fedulov

// Association of Certified Fraud Examiners, 2011. - Access mode: http://www.acferus.org/page.php?id=155. 2. Global Economic Crime Survey 2016 [Electronic resource] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2016. – 56 p. – Access mode: http://www.pwc.com/gx/en/economic-crimesurvey/pdf/GlobalEconomicCrimeSurvey2016.pdf. 3. Vsesvitnii ohliad dynamiky ekonomichnoi zlochinnosti. Zvit po Ukraini [Electronic resource] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2009. – 6 p. – Access mode: https://www.pwc.com/ua/en/services/forensic/assets/gecs_2009_report_ukraine_ukr.pdf. 4. Ukraina. Vsesvitnii ohliad ekonomichnykh zlochyniv. Kiberzlochyny v tsentri uvahy [Electronic resource] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2011. – 16 p. – Access mode: https://www.pwc.com/ua/uk/pressroom/assets/gecs_ukraine_ua.pdf. 5. Cybercrime: protecting against the growing threat [Electronic resource] // PricewaterhouseCoopers, 2011. - 40 p. - Access mode: http://pwc.blogs.com/files/2011global-economic-crime-survey-report.pdf. 6. Moskalenko N. Approaches to enterprises' financial and economic security management / N. Moskalenko, O. Romanenko, T. Oliinyk // Economic Annals-XXI. – 2015. – No. 7–8 (1). – P. 54–57. 7. Kovacich G. L. The Manager's Handbook for Corporate Security: Establishing and Managing a Successful Assets Protection Program / G. L. Kovacich, E. P. Halibozek. – Oxford: Butterworth-Heinemann, 2003. – 463 p. 8. Neskorodieva I. I. Doslidzhennia sutnosti ekonomichnoi katehorii "neplatospromozhnist pidpryjemstva" / I. I. Neskorodieva, S. A. Pustovhar // Ekonomika rozvytku. – 2013. – No. 3 (67). – P. 68–72. 9. Williams A. R. Corporate Manager's Security Handbook / A. R. Williams. – Bloomington: AuthorHouse, 2012. – 84 p. 10. Hayes B. Corporate Security Organizational Structure, Cost of Services and Staffing Benchmark: Research Report / D. Hayes, G. Kane, K. Kotwica. – Amsterdam: Elsevier, 2013. – 76 p.

Information about the author

N. Moskalenko – PhD in Economics, Associate Professor of the Department of Economic Analysis of Simon Kuznets Kharkiv National University of Economics (9-A Lenin Ave., Kharkiv, Ukraine, 61166, e-mail: natalia_moskalenko@hneu.edu.ua).

Інформація про автора

Москаленко Наталя Олександрівна — канд. екон. наук, доцент кафедри економічного аналізу Харківського національного економічного університету імені Семена Кузнеця (просп. Леніна, 9-А, м. Харків, Україна, 61166, e-mail: natalia moskalenko@ hneu.edu.ua).

Информация об авторе

Москаленко Наталья Александровна – канд. экон. наук, доцент кафедры экономического анализа
Харьковского национального экономического университета имени Семена Кузнеца (просп.
Ленина, 9-А, г. Харьков, Украина, 61166, e-mail: natalia_moskalenko@hneu.edu.ua).

Стаття надійшла до ред.

29.02.2016 p.